

1
2
3 **EAST GOSHEN TOWNSHIP**
4 **PLANNING COMMISSION WORKSHOP MEETING**
5 **February 16, 2011**

6 *The East Goshen Township Planning Commission held a scheduled workshop meeting on February 16, 2011 at the*
7 *East Goshen Township building. Members present were: Chairman George Martynick, Susan Carty, Peter Mylonas,*
8 *Dan Daley, Jim McRee, Megann Hedgecock and Al Zuccarello. Also present were Township Zoning Officer Mark*
9 *Gordon, Bryan Del Monte (Conservancy Board) and residents Erich Meyer and William Potts.*

10
11 **A. Pledge of Allegiance & Announcements**

12 George called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm and led those in attendance in the Pledge of Allegiance. There
13 was a moment of silence to remember our armed forces.

14
15 George asked if anyone would be recording the meeting. There was no response.

16
17 George asked those in attendance if there were any non-agenda items to be discussed. There was no response.

18
19 **B. Conditional Use and Variances**

20 **1. Liberty Towers, LLC/1594 Paoli Pike/ZV** – The applicant was represented by Richard J. Lemanowicz,
21 Esq., Paul Dugan, P.E. of Millennium Engineering, P.C., J. Michael Davis, Seidel Planning & Design, and
22 Kathryn Goodman, Advantage Engineers. Mr. Lemanowicz explained that Liberty Towers is still pursuing
23 installation of a cell tower in East Goshen Township and that they are aware of the many restrictions that limit
24 the placement of a tower. They are aware that there is the possibility of a site in the East Goshen Park, but they
25 will continue to pursue the site behind the WAWA. When asked by George if there was a lease, Mr.
26 Lemanowicz confirmed that there is a signed lease between WAWA and Liberty Towers and gave documents to
27 Mark Gordon. Liberty Towers has 2 carriers signed and 2 waiting. They only have to prove that one carrier
28 needs the coverage at the requested height.

29
30 George mentioned that Yerkes recommends that the distance from the tower to the adjoining facilities be more
31 than the height of the tower. Mr. Lamanowicz stated that it is not unusual to have towers close to schools, road,
32 etc. The tower is designed not to fail and fall over. It would fall in segments. He is only aware of one
33 circumstance were a tower fell over and that occurred during construction.

34
35 Al commented that a new, small radio cube is being introduced at a conference in Spain. He feels towers may
36 become obsolete and replaced by these small boxes which can be put on light poles, phone poles, etc.
37 Mr. Dugan explained that there are many types of DAS facilities used in different circumstances. All are used
38 to compliment towers. Actually, the height of towers has reduced over time, but the need to fill coverage gaps
39 is still there. Networks have changed so the towers are needed to meet new demands.

40
41 Mr. Dugan provided the Commission members with packets containing exhibits they will use to support their
42 case. He performed a study to look at the service needed in East Goshen. He actually grew up here and
43 attended East Goshen Elementary School. The map shows the main roads and the location of the proposed
44 facility. There is a 1 mile and 2 mile radius to show if there are existing services or tall structures that could be
45 used. He pointed out where the other existing units are in steeples, on poles, etc. There are 6 main wireless
46 providers with varying degrees of reliability. Liberty Towers wants to provide in vehicle and in building service
47 at all times during the day.

48
49 The propagation exhibits show what is currently being provided. Green indicates in-building service, yellow
50 shows sufficient in-vehicle service, and white shows the probability of unreliable service. An adverse call
51 service of 5% is sufficient for a carrier to want to fill the gap. Safety services can be impacted. Enhanced 911
52 must locate the caller within 100 feet. Mr. Lemanowicz commented that the Wireless Communications Services
53 Act states that a township can't restrict or prohibit emergency services.

1 Mr. Dugan feels that DAS (Distributed Antenna System) is a solution for a targeted area, i.e. stadium, mall,
2 college campus, etc. but not in a large, open outside area. To put a DAS on every phone pole would create a lot
3 of clutter because they have to be connected by wiring. A single tower will handle future changes better than
4 DAS. DAS provides very limited additional coverage and only supports one carrier. Mark mentioned that
5 Applebrook Golf Club and newer housing developments all have underground wiring. He pointed out where
6 DAS units are in the township.
7

8 Peter asked if there is a difference in the elevation between the WAWA site and East Goshen Park, and did they
9 do a propagation study for the site in the park.

10 Paul answered that the exhibit map shows both to be similar. He is not aware that there is a site available in the
11 park but could be considered. The slight movement to another site may impact the propagation study. It is
12 preferable to be at the WAWA because of the close proximity to the main roads going through the township.

13 Paul explained that the data for the propagation study came from the carriers but he also verified the data.

14 Dan commented that when he looked up AT&T's service maps, they showed the service for this area as good.

15 Mr. Lemanowicz feels this is a marketing tool and isn't adequate to use when determining where to put a tower.
16 When a tower is no longer needed, it is removed.
17

18 Mark Gordon mentioned that there is an area behind the township building which may be viable. The
19 Ordinance does not allow a tower there either.
20

21 Mike Davis, Planning Consultant, provided copies of his presentation to the Commission members. In the
22 yellow circle at the intersection of Paoli Pike and N. Chester Road, only one district, I2, allows a tower. The I2
23 area is not interested. The Historic District is the ultimate limitation, about 465 feet away. The closest
24 residential structure is 360 feet away. The East Goshen Elementary school is 190 feet way which answers the
25 question about a fall zone. Mike reviewed other limitations which led them to the location at the WAWA.
26

27 Mark asked about the historic process. Mr. Lemanowicz explained that they are required to obtain permission
28 from PA SHPO. Historic Goshenville is a "hit". It is on the National Registry so they have to do something
29 about the adverse visual impact on Historic Goshenville. It requires some collaborative effort. As an example,
30 at Antietam National Battlefield they installed a 150 foot unipole with the antennas inside and painted it brown.
31 A unipole is wider so the antennas can fit and it can be painted a color.
32

33 Mr. Lemanowicz has only done wireless communications. Over the years, the tower height has shortened.
34 What has increased is, the facilities at the base, the number of antennas on a tower, and more towers.
35

36 Sue asked what would happen if the WAWA closes and they take the building down. Mark replied that another
37 retail use could be put there. Mark feels there are easements in the parking lot between the Pepper Mill and the
38 WAWA and they would work together on it.
39

40 Peter is concerned about the attractive nuisance the tower would be to children. Mr. Lemanowicz reported that
41 there is barbed wire on top of the fence and the first 25 to 30 feet of the tower are smooth.
42

43 Mark mentioned that the park is where people want to get away from things like this, so the residents oppose a
44 tower in the park. There are 9 properties in 1/2 mile ring from a possible site in the park. Also, there are many
45 historic resources within 1.5 miles. The township staff feels the property that the township building is on may
46 be a good location.
47

48 Jim would like to suggest to the Board of Supervisors that out of the alternative sites discussed, we recommend
49 the township building location but, as to the site on the application at the WAWA, he would give an approval of
50 a recommendation with conditions. He feels approval with conditions would be better than a denial with none.
51 Peter is opposed based on the 9 variance requests and being next to the school playground area. He would like
52 it to be covered like the one in Antietam.

53 Al feels the Board of Supervisors should be told that while the commission doesn't recommend this site, we do
54 recommend some alternative site.
55

1 **Public Comment:**

2 1. William Potts, 1603 E. Boot Road – He is concerned about the height and the fact that it is overlooking a
3 historic area. It should be covered or put on another site.
4

5 Jim moved to recommend to the Board of Supervisors approval to find a way to approve a site at the township
6 building or the township park and then the WAWA..

7 There was no second. Jim withdrew his motion.

8 Peter suggested doing a denial on the WAWA site then give an addendum recommending immediate action to
9 look at other sites and conditions.
10

11 Sue made the following motion: I move that we recommend that the Board of Supervisors oppose these variance
12 requests based on the fact that the applicant has not provided evidence of any hardship(s) to support either the
13 use or the dimensional zoning variance requests, as required by law. Granting these variance requests for a
14 wireless communications tower use in the center of the community, next to three elementary schools and
15 adjacent to the Township historic district, would have a significant negative impact on the quality of life and
16 greatly alter the essential character of the surrounding neighborhoods. Peter seconded the motion. There was no
17 further discussion. The motion passed. Jim voted no.

18 Addendum to the motion – Jim moved to recommend to the Board of Supervisors to find a way to accommodate
19 a wireless communication facility in the immediate area. Al seconded the motion. There was no further
20 discussion. The motion passed unanimously.
21

22 **C. Old Business**

23 Wireless Communications Ordinance – Will be discussed at the next meeting.

24 **D. New Business** – None

25 **E. Liaisons**

26 The following liaison assignments were made:

- 27 1. West Chester Regional – Al
- 28 2. Municipal Authority – Dan
- 29 3. Conservancy Board – Sue
- 30 4. Historical Commission – George
- 31 5. Park & Recreation – Peter
- 32 6. Board of Supervisors – Jim
- 33 7. Willistown – Megann
34

35 **F. Any Other Matter**

36 1. Toll Bros. Development/Willistown Twp. at Line Road and Paoli Pike – George gave a summary of the
37 plan. These are carriage homes. In Phase 1 they plan to build 54 units with a total of 139 units. There will
38 be a clubhouse and pool. The entrance will be on Line Road. Improvements will be made to the intersection
39 at Paoli Pike and Line Road and to the entrance to the Bryn Mawr Rehab Center.
40

41 **H. Adjournment**

42 Motion to adjourn the meeting was made by Al and seconded by Sue. The meeting adjourned at 10:00 p.m.
43
44

45 Respectfully submitted, _____
46 *Ruth Kiefer, Recording Secretary*
47

48 C:\Documents and Settings\Owner\My Documents\My Word\Planning Commission\PC 2011\PC 02162011 WSfinal.doc